



PNG ACCIDENT INVESTIGATION COMMISSION

OFFICE OF THE CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER

PNG AIC Office, Top Floor, Tabari Haus, Boroko
PO Box 1709
BOROKO 111
National Capital District
Papua New Guinea

Telephone : (675) 323 2911
Facsimile : (675) 323 2139
Email : dinau@aic.gov.pg

Safety Recommendation: AIC 15-R10/15-2019

Addressed to: PNG Air Services Limited

Date issued: 5 August 2015

Investigation link: AIC 15-2019

Action status: Issued

Safety deficiency description

On the morning of 13 April 2015, a Fokker F27 Mk 050 registered P2-TAH and a Bombardier DHC-8 registered P2-MCT both received traffic alert and collision-avoidance system (TCAS) advisory information and took evasive manoeuvring action to avoid each other at 19,000 ft approximately 40 km east of Kerema.

The approach of the two aircraft towards one another at the same altitude was detected, by three different automated systems, one in each aircraft (the traffic alert and collision-avoidance system (TCAS)), and shortly after, one in the air traffic control system (the radar system's short term conflict alert (STCA)). As a result, evasive manoeuvring was carried out by the flight crews and the aircraft continued to their destinations without further incident.

With respect to PNG Air Services Limited the AIC investigation determined that:

- The radar controllers did not effectively cross reference read-backs from the crew of TAH against flight strips and radar information with reference to assigned altitude and did not effectively monitor the flight progress. Despite a number of opportunities to address the error, the controllers did not notice that TAH was not flying at its assigned altitude.
- The use of the word normally in PNG *Aeronautical Information Publication ENR 1.1-2 Section 2.12.2* is not considered to have the strength of a requirement.

Recommendation number AIC 15-R10/15-2019 to PNG Air Services Limited

The PNG Accident Investigation Commission recommends that PNG Air Services Limited should amend the PNG *Aeronautical Information Publication ENR 1.1-2 Section 2.12.2* by replacing

‘An airways clearance normally contain the following items

...

d) assigned level

with

‘An airways clearance **shall** contain the following items

...

d) assigned level

in **all** onwads clearance instructions issued to aircraft.

Action requested

The AIC requests that PNG Air Services Ltd note recommendation AIC 15-R10/15-2019 above, and provide a response to the AIC within 60 days of the issue date, and explain (including with evidence) how PNG ASL has addressed the safety deficiency identified in the AIC investigation report AIC 15-2019.



DAVID INAU, ML

Chief Executive Officer

PNG Air Services Limited response

Signed response dated 17 August 2015.

In regard to the recommendation number AIC 15-R10/15-2019, it would be incorrect to state ‘An airways clearance shall contain the following items’ as a clearance may not necessarily include all the elements a) through g), listed at the AIP reference. I submit that the current wording at the AIP reference is appropriate as it conveys the correct meaning and I note that the wording is almost identical to the Australian AIP. i.e.: that document states ‘normally’ and not ‘shall’. Therefore I propose to not act on this recommendation.


PNG Accident Investigation Commission (AIC) assessment of PNG Air Services Limited (ASL) response

The AIC has assessed the ASL response as **unsatisfactory not accepted**. Subsequent to receiving the written response, the AIC met with ASL on 2 September 2015 to discuss the safety concern. ASL maintained its position as stated in its written response.

The AIC strongly holds the view that particularly in the area of aviation safety, Papua New Guinea should be a leader and not a follower. Therefore the fact that the PNG AIP mirrors the wording of the Australian AIP does not justify the ASL decision not to clarify and amend the PNG AIP to improve aviation safety.

The AIC has determined that the safety deficiency identified in the recommendation AIC 15-R10/15-2019 will continue to put persons, property or the environment at risk. Due to PNG ASL stating and demonstrating that ASL will take no safety action to reduce or eliminate the identified safety deficiency, the AIC has assigned the following status.

Status of the AIC Recommendation AIC 15-R10/15-2019: **CLOSED not accepted**



DAVID INAU, ML

Chief Executive Officer

10 October 2015